

Ross strongly criticises McDonnell's chart (p.92-94) and assumes that McDonnell's reference in the title 'from original surveys' means that McDonnell carried out the surveys himself. But if the meaning of the title, 'compiled [by McDonnell] from original surveys [carried out by various navigators]',¹¹ is clarified, one major problem with the chart disappears. Ross further believes that McDonnell created 'its hideous inaccuracies and gross distortions'. That there were inaccuracies and distortions in New Zealand charts long before McDonnell's chart appeared is well known. But how do these known inaccuracies and distortions relate to McDonnell's chart? The detailed examination which follows will show that McDonnell has in fact compounded virtually the entire coastlines of his chart from earlier printed charts.

The compounding of a number of separate charts into a new chart was not an uncommon practice among early chart publishers. Published charts showing Australia around 1650 provide good examples of the compounding of charts prepared by various early navigators who independently charted portions of the extremely long Australian coastline.¹² New Zealand has the fine example of a compounded early chart prepared by Lottin, reproduced as figure 4, and discussed in the summary.

A convenient starting point for comparing McDonnell's compounded chart with earlier printed charts is Tasman Bay. French Pass as delineated indicates that McDonnell referred to d'Urville's atlas published in 1833 only the year before publication of McDonnell's chart. Close examination of the east coast of the North Island, both coasts in the Cook Strait area, and the northern part of the west coast of the South Island from slightly south of 'Les Cinq Doigts du milieu' shows that McDonnell has copied these coastlines from Lottin's 1833 chart (figure 4). The northern coast of Aupouri Peninsula which McDonnell has copied from Lottin stems from Beautemps-Beaupré's 1807 printed chart. The entire west coast of the North Island including the mythical 'Taranaki Bay' depicted on McDonnell's chart is almost identical with de Blosseville's 1827 printed chart (figure 2). McDonnell has not copied de Blosseville's chart direct but Lottin's 1833 chart which is compounded from de Blosseville's and other charts.

It is difficult to understand why McDonnell ignored de Blosseville's southern chart published in Duperrey's 1827 atlas as it had the authority of Captain Edwardson of the *Snapper* behind it and it gives a detailed and convincing delineation of the southern coastlines (see figure 3). The British Admiralty thought highly enough of this French printed chart to publish it in 1833 as part of Admiralty chart 1099. For the South Island and Stewart Island except for the northern part of the South Island, McDonnell appears