

he had never been near the Bay—though he could not resist talking about the battle, probably the only one he had witnessed. He may then also have adopted, as an additional cover, the name by which he is known to us. This would explain one missing link in the chain of evidence by which some dozen years of his life have here been traced. The Mitchell Library holds musters of the crew on all the outward voyages of the *Magnet* between 1815 and 1821, but the name Rutherford is not among them.<sup>46</sup> We must then either believe that it was not his real one, adopted only when he left New Zealand, or else all the substantiated details in his story cease to offer proof of his direct involvement in them. Even, in this case, his account of Maori life and his report on people and events in the Bay of Islands might be considered suspect. If he knew only of the *Magnet*, the name of its master, and its voyage to the South Seas by hearsay, then, it could be supposed, he knew only of New Zealand and Tahiti in the same way—or could be so supposed but for the indelible evidence on face and body. Whatever else is fiction, the portrait proves that he lived among the Polynesian people of those islands.

Ormond Wilson

#### References

- <sup>1</sup> For identification of artist's name, details of portrait and other incidental information see C. A. O. Fox *Bibliographical Notes on John Rutherford & Barnet Burns* published by *History & Bibliography*, Christchurch 1950. The Turnbull portrait was from the Fox collection
- <sup>2</sup> Craik *op cit* p 87
- <sup>3</sup> *Ibid* p 143
- <sup>4</sup> See Fox *op cit* for details. ATL holds the undated edition and also a photocopy of a later pamphlet which is almost an exact reprint of the references to Rutherford in Craik's book, Craik's asides and all, though one section, more briefly summarised by Craik, appears to be printed in extenso from the Rutherford MS
- <sup>5</sup> Craik pp 86-97, 114, 134-7, 155-9, 191-8, 214-6, 246-7, 251-6, 274-9
- <sup>6</sup> *Ibid* p 278
- <sup>7</sup> *Ibid* p 86
- <sup>8</sup> *Ibid* p 278
- <sup>9</sup> *Ibid* pp 317-36
- <sup>10</sup> W. L. Williams 'The Story of John Rutherford', *Transactions of the New Zealand Institute* Vol 23 (1890) pp 458-61
- <sup>11</sup> Craik pp 214-5
- <sup>12</sup> *Ibid* pp 247, 251-6
- <sup>13</sup> *Ibid* pp 155, 196-7
- <sup>14</sup> *Ibid* p 255; S. Percy Smith *Maori Wars of the Nineteenth Century* (1910) pp 343-4
- <sup>15</sup> Craik p 215
- <sup>16</sup> *Ibid* pp 251-2; Marmon's reminiscences were printed in the *New Zealand Herald* at intervals between 9 October & 11 December 1880. (A totally different version, published in part in the *Auckland Star* and in full in the *Otago Witness* appears to be mainly fictional.)
- <sup>17</sup> James Kemp Journal, 9 February 1825 (APL)
- <sup>18</sup> James Stack Journal, 6 March 1825 (Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society microfilm in ATL)