

Collier in the review began by outlining briefly some European and American bibliographies and then passed to New Zealand:

We have manfully done our part in these remote regions. Australia has catalogued down to a recent date all the publications relating to Australia¹², and it was a great achievement, even if only the titles of the books were given. New Zealand ahead of her contemporaries here as in so much else, has done a great deal for her literature. Only mentioning the useful lists in Thomson's and Wakefield's works and Mr Davis's fuller catalogue, the writer may be permitted to acknowledge a royal octavo issued by the Government just twenty years ago. It was really the first bibliography of that literature. Depending largely on the excellent, but incomplete, collection in the Parliamentary Library, he went in chase of books to be found in other collections, or noted down what he could learn of inaccessible works. Acquaintances in the colony and friends abroad strenuously aided him, especially in the mazes of German literature. His plan included an account of each book in some detail; sometimes a critical appraisal of it; indications about the author and recovery of his name, if the book were anonymous; the circumstances under which it was written, if these were significant... Besides two separate indexes of authors and titles, there was a classified catalogue, where not only books, but their contents were distributed under a series of headings....

The possessor of the completest collection of New Zealandiana in existence — a collection now generously bestowed on the University of Otago — has resumed the never-to-be-finished task. All the leisure of a busy professional life has been lavished on the patriotic duty of fitting himself to be the bibliographer of New Zealand. In fulfilment of it he has gathered together from every source all the books, maps, charts, manuscripts, letters and curios that could throw light on the history of the colony. He has ransacked public libraries and private collections. He has interviewed every person in the Dominion of any importance.... In 1903 he spent some months at the Record Office tabulating the correspondence of the New Zealand Company and the documents connected with its eventful history.... Minute researches among the other *incunabula* of New Zealand have made of him an expert. A more highly qualified bibliographer could not be found.

Collier then proceeded to join issue with Hocken over the scope of the bibliography claiming that the discrepancy between the size of his own work and that of the Doctor's was due not merely to the new items included but because Hocken's work included not merely the literature relating to New Zealand (the scope of Collier's and the title-page definition of Hocken's) but also the literature published in it, whether or not of any specific New Zealand association. 'The first of Dr Hocken's loans from his predecessor,' Collier wrote, 'is to be found on the title-page. I had named my compilation *The literature relating to New Zealand: a Bibliography*, and rightly, because only publications relating to New Zealand are included in it. Dr Hocken similarly calls his work *A Bibliography of the Literature Relating to New Zealand*. The title is a complete misnomer. The doctor has spread a wider net than mine, with smaller loops, which nothing published in New Zealand is allowed to escape. ... I cannot help thinking that this extreme inclusiveness is a mistaken policy.' He objected also to the inclusion of non-New Zealand works by authors such as E. G. Wakefield and A. Domett many of