

Ellen Attwood (15) was next called by Mr. Harper. She said she had been in the Orphanage four years, and was still there. She used to have porridge (with milk if she wanted it) and bread and dripping for breakfast, hot meat and vegetables for dinner, bread and butter and cake twice a week for tea. She never went hungry, and never made any complaints to anybody. She had had dry bread for punishment, but very seldom; it was usually at breakfast. She would not eat the dry bread if sulky. She had been put on silence, but not very often; if off the premises—on the way to school and back—she was allowed to speak to the others, even when on silence. She used to talk to Mrs. Carpenter and Miss McArthur when on silence; it was not a very terrible punishment, because they hardly ever kept it. She had been punished with a strap and also sent to bed immediately after tea. Only once did she hear Mrs. Carpenter use bad language; she called the children 'darned children' because they were throwing balls against the clean clothes. She liked Mrs. Carpenter and Miss McArthur.

To the Commissioner: 'The longest she was on silence was a month. She was given a week, and then as she broke it, she was given extra weeks until the month was made up. They were not 'allowed' to speak, but did so.

Dr. Crooke, house-surgeon at the Hospital, was called by Mr. Harper. Witness recollected Percy Whittle being admitted to the Hospital in August last. Witness spoke to the boy, but the latter said nothing about ill-treatment; he said to the nurse he would like to get back to the Orphanage. The boy made a very good recovery, which was evidence that he had not been badly treated before. They had had children at the Hospital frequently from the Orphanage, who certainly showed no signs of neglect. Frankie Hammond, who had been there most frequently, and had lost one leg owing to hip disease, showed particular signs of having been very kindly looked after. None of the children admitted showed signs of neglect, or having been kept till the last minute before being sent.

Mrs. Crooke, wife of the former witness said in reply to Mr. Lane that she used to visit Lyttelton Orphanage on winter days, before and since Mrs. Carpenter's appointment. Witness had not gone for two years, having been ill. She went on alternate Saturdays, sometimes unexpectedly, and the children were alone with her. The sewing lessons were informal, and the children were unrestrained and quite free. They were well-mannered and never used bad language. They seemed very fond of Mrs. Carpenter. Witness did not see the children at meals, but they always seemed well fed. They were bright and happy and made no complaints, and spoke with affection of the matron.

Frankie Hammond (14) said he had been at the Orphanage about five years; his leg had been amputated since entering the institution. He got on well with Mrs. Carpenter, and when he got the strap deserved it; it did not hurt him. He had had dry bread, but not often. He had not heard Mrs. Carpenter call the children bad names. They had plenty of play at the Orphanage. He used to go to Mrs. Peachy's every Saturday to be taught chair-caring by Mr. Mellish. He told Mrs. Peachy about the hiding he had had. He got on well with Miss McArthur. He always had plenty to eat, and liked bread and dripping. Witness had not heard anybody called 'liars,' or 'darned orphans'; he had spoken to the school children about the Orphanage, but could not remember what he said; he was in the seventh standard at school.

Sydney B. Harris, in his seventh year as a member of the Charitable Aid Board, said he was on the Charitable Aid and the Institutions Committee. He had often visited the Orphanage on a number of occasions alone. He was perfectly satisfied with the children; they always looked very happy and comfortable. Witness went to see Percy Whittle with Messrs. Scott and Horrell. The boy was very thin and emaciated, and witness remarked that he looked very ill. Mr. Scott asked Dr. Crooke if the boy had been neglected, and the doctor, to the best of witness's recollection, replied 'Not necessarily.' He told Mr. Scott he would support him in securing an investigation, and if the charges against Mrs. Carpenter concerning the boy were proved, she would not be fit to hold the position. He did not remember saying to Mrs. Wells after visiting the Hospital 'that he had seen a sight he would never forget as long as he lived.' Nor did he say that Mrs. Carpenter would have to go. He did tell Mrs. Wells that if Mrs. Carpenter was responsible for the condition of the boy she was not fit to hold her position.

After the luncheon adjournment Mr. Harper called Sarah Smith (17½). She said she was at the Orphanage for nine months, entering when she was thirteen. She had been in service at several places since leaving

She liked being at the Orphanage, where she was kindly treated. She went to school when she was there; there was no restriction as to talking outside the Orphanage when children were on silence.

Maud Stewart (19½) said she was in the Orphanage for a little over two years. She was now cook at Strathmore Hospital, and learnt her cooking at the Orphanage. She liked being at the Orphanage.

John Dobson, member of the Charitable Aid Board for ten years, was called by Mr. Lane. He said he was on the Institutions Committee as well as others. He had been on the former since joining the Board, and was now chairman. The Institutions Committee was responsible to the Board for the Orphanage. The secretary practically took his instructions from the committee. In all his experience he had never had to complain about the accounts. He had frequently visited the Orphanage; the committee often went there unannounced. The children had always appeared to be in a satisfactory condition, they seemed well looked after, and never seemed oppressed. He had never heard any complaints as to the language of Mrs. Carpenter, and so far as he could judge she had carried out her duties satisfactorily.

William Shakespeare Wharton, accountant at the Charitable Aid Board Office, stated that he had asked Mrs. Carpenter to explain accounts on one or two occasions. He did that so as to be prepared if any remark was made.

SEVENTH DAY.

On Friday morning Mr. Cassidy, was given permission to call Mrs. Temby.

Witness said she went to the Lyttelton Orphanage as assistant matron in 1900. Mrs. Carpenter went there the same day as matron. Mrs. Carpenter was also inspector for the Board, and used to leave at 7.30 in the morning, and return at about 5.30 p.m. That continued until witness left, in 1902, having been there a year and eight months. There were no children in at first, but they began to be admitted very soon. Witness had no difficulty with the children; she had no definite instructions from the Board as to her duties. Witness never beat any of the children, and got along with them all right until a month or so before she left, and that was because Mrs. Carpenter told the children to take no notice of witness, and to annoy her as much as possible. Mrs. Carpenter said she would get witness out of her position, and in January, 1902, she received a month's notice to leave from Mr. Norris. Mr. Norris added in a subsequent letter that there was nothing at all against Mrs. Temby's character, and he hoped to hear of her success on leaving. Mrs. Carpenter also gave her a good testimonial. Witness did not consider Mrs. Carpenter's language ladylike. Mrs. Carpenter used to jeer at witness taking the children to Sunday school, and remarked: 'Oh, dear little —, they should go to school.' The matron used to say 'Damn you, go on' to the children, and had no patience with them. On one occasion, when witness returned from a day's holiday, Mrs. Carpenter used very bad language to her; shortly after witness received notice. When witness complained about the children making a noise, Mrs. Carpenter said, 'Oh, they can make a h— of a noise for all I care.' Mrs. Carpenter used to beat the children, generally on a Sunday, when she was at home. The Andrews' went to the Orphanage when witness was there, and they were well behaved and never used bad language. She had never heard Mrs. Carpenter refer to either of the Andrews' as 'Kate.' Mrs. Carpenter used to teach the girls fancy work, but not sewing. Witness used to do all the sewing. She knew Ellen Attwood was strapped twice within half an hour one Sunday. That was a fairly lively day; Mrs. Carpenter used to say that she 'liked to see things moving.' Eva Bashford was not a bad girl; she was a splendid worker, and very intelligent, but required proper handling. One of the little boys was strapped and made to eat his food at table with his hands tied, because of a certain bad habit he had. No reports were sent to the Board regarding the children individually; they went to school regularly. She had seen Mrs. Carpenter smoking cigars in the Orphanage. It was not before the children, but in the dining-room of an evening after the children had gone to bed, and on Sunday mornings in witness' sitting-room.

Julia Carpenter was called by Mr. Harper. She said she had two children of her own, and before becoming matron at Lyttelton Orphanage acted as inspector for the Board, having to visit applicants for relief, investigate their cases, and visit the boarded out children. She had a great many cases to visit, and for eighteen months was matron and inspector. Mrs. Temby and witness worked well together; Mrs. Temby complained once or twice in regard to the boy Attwood. Witness