

*Mr. Hanan:* Surely he can state the case.

*The Chairman:* You can speak to the question, Mr. Craigie.

*Mr. Craigie:* I was leading up to it. I was going to make a suggestion. We had a very heavy week last week and sat all that day, and I do not think when you sit up all day and night that your temper is the very best. I think you will admit that. I have been under a good many chairmen, and had a good deal of experience as a chairman myself, and I wish to say candidly to Mr. Hine that he had with the very best intention sometimes spoken in a very abrupt manner.

*The Chairman:* I must ask you to resume your chair. I am not going to have the Chairman's action criticized or attacked.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* Except in a constitutional way.

*The Chairman:* Yes, of course. Every member of the Committee has a constitutional way of bringing any matter before the Speaker if I give a wrong ruling.

*Mr. Craigie:* I was going to make a suggestion to you, Mr. Hine.

*The Chairman:* I do not want any suggestions in that way; it is lowering the dignity of the Committee.

*Mr. Hanan:* Are you not curtailing free discussion?

*The Chairman:* I shall not allow any reflections on the Chair.

*Mr. Hanan:* It is not my intention to do so. I would object to any reflections cast upon the Chair, and I would uphold any member in a similar position, but he can criticize.

*Mr. Craigie:* Well, will you allow me to make my suggestions?

*The Chairman:* Not in that direction.

*Mr. Craigie:* I wish to say that you can see the position Sir Joseph Ward is in in connection with the whole affair, and I think if I make the suggestion that you say, perhaps that you did not wish to—

*The Chairman:* I must ask you to resume your seat, and if you cannot make any other suggestion than that I should accept some responsibility in the matter when it is a question that the report be referred back to the House, then I must rule you out. Does any other member wish to speak before I put the resolution?

*Mr. Pearce:* I would like to say a word or two, and would ask, is it not possible that the words be withdrawn? I do not think there is any one on this Committee but must recognize that the words are unparliamentary. I do not think there is any doubt in the mind of any member of the Committee, whether it is a question of party or not, that that is the correct procedure to take in this case. I was not present when the incident occurred, but if there was anything objectionable before the words were used, the Committee would be prepared to meet Sir Joseph Ward. We would then be allowed to discuss it. I think it is quite competent for this Committee to refer anything the Chairman does here to the Speaker of the House. That can be done, and that is the proper course to take; but it seems to me that if any member of the Committee can refer to the Chairman or any speaker with impertinence, there must be chaos, and it seems that the only way is to withdraw the words. I hope Sir Joseph Ward will consider the matter and take that course. I think it is the only course under the circumstances, and I wish he would do so.

*Mr. Hanan:* Are we not going to have a full statement of the evidence of the proceedings in regard to this incident?

*The Chairman:* That will be the subject of a subsequent resolution. I will put the resolution: "That the Public Accounts Committee reports to the House that Sir Joseph Ward refused to withdraw the words complained of in the report as presented to the House on Monday, 21st October."

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I think, Mr. Chairman, as a matter of fairness to the Committee as a whole, that an amendment ought to be included in that, and I will move an amendment myself. I have no objection to that report going to the House, but I move that the following words be added: "It being ruled by the Chairman that I should do so before consideration of the report from the House."

*The Chairman:* I cannot accept the amendment. I gave the Committee an opportunity of referring to the matter if my ruling was incorrect, and the Committee did not take the opportunity at that time of reporting my ruling to the House, and I must rule the amendment out.

*Mr. Hanan:* Have you ruled that we cannot discuss the report?

*The Chairman:* We are discussing the report now.

(The motion was then put and carried.)

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I should like to ask what position the Committee is going to take up with regard to further evidence. I understand witnesses have been called.

*Mr. Hanan:* I move that a full statement of the evidence in respect of this incident be furnished to the House, and all the evidence bearing on this incident.

*The Chairman:* I should like to draw attention to the fact that what has been prepared is only an extract, but what I wish to emphasize is that there have been no excisions, but there has been an attempt made, possibly unwittingly, to suggest that there has been something kept out of this report. The question is that a full report of the incident as far as available be submitted with the report to the House.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I know what it is going to lead to; it is going to lead to a very large discussion in the House. There is only one plain issue before us—that is, as to obeying the ruling of the Chair and using the words to the Chair. I will not object, but I think we are going further than we as a Committee can go in reporting this matter.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I think the particular question put to me and my answer to it would be sufficient.

*The Chairman:* I will prepare a statement and submit it to Sir Joseph Ward and Mr. Hanan.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I do not want it.