

tioned and his actions can be questioned in the proper way by a motion. We cannot impose indignities upon the Chairman, nor do we want to impose any indignities upon any ordinary member. I think the words used were used in the heat of the moment, and now I ask Sir Joseph to consider not only his own position but the position of others of us here, and the position of the Committee, and urge on him as strongly as I can, personally, to withdraw the words. If he has got any grievance, after the words are withdrawn, and we are placed in the position in which we may consider his grievance, let us have it out and let us consider it. I am prepared to consider any grievance he has in a non-party and non-political way, and give him my assurance on that. I am doing this in a kindly spirit. I do not want to move any resolution. Obviously it is my duty to move a resolution—we cannot remain where we are now—and might I ask him in fairness, speaking in a friendly way and not in any political spirit, to reconsider the position and put us in the position in which, if he has got any grievance, we can rectify that grievance. The Chairman's ruling must be upheld.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* Mr. Chairman, I can only thank Mr. Allen, which I do, for his suggestion to me, but I regret I cannot accept it. I cannot accept it for the reason that I have looked upon the Chairman's statement to me as particularly offensive and uncalled-for, because I had answered the question. As a matter of fact, I would prefer to receive the censure of the House rather than withdraw the statement which I made, believing I was justified in making. I looked upon it as political bias against me, and I regret to say that is confirmed to-day, and that nothing more arbitrary or more exceptional in the attitude of a Chairman, even I think in any parliamentary Committee in the world, has ever known or ever seen. The House directed a report to come here for consideration, and the Chairman, with all the powers centred in a Chairman, declined to allow a member of Parliament to refer to the report, and still I am asked under such circumstances to withdraw the words. I say I have no feeling against Mr. Hine, but I can only say that the action is such that one can only compare it to a martinet, that the whole report of Parliament is set aside before I can refer to it. I can only express very great regret that I cannot withdraw the expression I used before.

*Mr. Lee:* I was not at the meeting. What was the offensive remark, Sir Joseph, made to you by Mr. Hine that you took exception to that led up to the remark which you made yourself?

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I was upon my oath giving evidence before the Committee. Mr. Allen was questioning me, and I was answering his questions. No appeal was made by Mr. Allen to the Chairman as to whether I was answering those questions to his satisfaction or otherwise. The Chairman of his own accord told me to answer the question or refuse to answer it. He repeated it again by asking me to answer it straight.

*The Chairman:* That is not putting it fair.

*Mr. Lee:* What remark did he make at which you took offence?

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* He dictated to me as to how I should answer the question.

*Mr. Lee:* What was the expression you took exception to?

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* He told me to answer or refuse to answer, and I say that is an improper thing to say to a witness. I was giving my evidence upon oath, my answers were being recorded, and whatever answers I gave were there to speak for themselves. I said nothing offensive to Mr. Allen or to any member of the Committee. The Chairman must have had some reason for telling me to answer the question or refuse to answer it.

*Mr. Lee:* What am I to understand leads you to believe that you were justified in using the expression?

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* What I hold is this: that before we got to the point of this matter being reported to the House, the Chairman, as a matter of fairness to a brother member of the Committee, should have withdrawn, and I would have readily withdrawn and apologized; but he has allowed an offensive statement to go on record, and he then asks me to withdraw the reply I made to the offensive statement. If I had lost my self-respect I might withdraw, but I have not lost my self-respect, and I would prefer to receive the censure of the House instead of withdrawing the remark.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I move that the Committee adjourn for half an hour, and I do so in the hope that we may bring about a settlement, that Sir Joseph Ward may consult with his own friends, and I hope they will consult with him.

(Motion to adjourn agreed to.)

On resuming,—

*The Chairman:* The Committee has resumed. The question before the Committee is the consideration of the report referred back to the Committee, and I will ask some member to put it in order by moving some resolution in the matter.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I would like to ask Sir Joseph, before I move any resolution, whether on reconsideration he can see his way to withdraw the words, which I think he will admit on calm consideration ought to be withdrawn.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* Mr. Chairman, I can only say, in reply to Mr. Allen, that I am exceedingly sorry that I cannot see my way to do as suggested. I want to say that I have no personal feeling of any sort or kind against Mr. Hine. I felt at the time that the statement was very offensive to me as a public man. He thinks it is all right, and I cannot, and, of course, will not, press him to make it possible for me to do what I would be willing to do.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* Under the circumstances I am afraid there is nothing else for me to do but to move that the Committee report to the House that Sir Joseph Ward refused to withdraw the words, "It is a downright piece of impertinence."

*The Chairman:* I will state the question moved by Mr. Allen: "That the Public Accounts Committee reports to the House that Sir Joseph Ward refused to withdraw the words complained of in the report as presented to the House on Monday, 21st October."