

*The Chairman:* I must draw attention to this fact, that all the clerk was instructed to do was to note down the words used by Sir Joseph Ward. He was not instructed to take down any words used by myself, and therefore the clerk has done his duty by recording the words used.

*Mr. Myers:* I think we all regret the unfortunate incident of the use of the words, and when the Chairman used the words might I ask did the Chairman do so with the intention that they should be used in any offensive manner?

*The Chairman:* I must rule that you have no right to raise such a question at all at this discussion.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I think it is quite wrong.

*Mr. Myers:* Well, Mr. Chairman, I think——

*The Chairman:* I must ask you to resume your seat.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I move that the words "answer straight or refuse to answer" be recorded in the minutes.

*The Chairman:* I must rule the motion out of order, because it is——

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* If not I will put on record that the minutes are not correct.

*The Chairman:* I must ask you to resume your chair.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* I want to enter my protest, and I want it to be recorded, that those words used by the Chairman to me and reported in the Press, "Answer straight or refuse to answer the question," are not recorded in the minutes to-day, and that the minutes are an incorrect record of these proceedings.

*Dr. Newman:* I think the best course would be that, as we cannot remember the exact words, the matter should be postponed until the next meeting to see if we can get the exact words.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* It would go on record that the Press so reported it. The *Evening Post* is here, and that was accepted by Mr. Myers and others as a very accurate report. This is what the *Evening Post* says: "The Chairman (Mr. Hine) rose: I must ask you to answer the question, Sir Joseph, or refuse to answer it." That is what was said as far as I recollect. What is recorded in the minutes—"Answer the question, Sir Joseph, or refuse to answer it"—and the type-written report corresponds with the minutes. The *Dominion* report is, "Mr. Hine: I must ask you to answer the question or refuse to answer it." The *New Zealand Times* does have the word "Mr. Hine asked him to answer the question straight." Two of the papers do not use the word "straight," one apparently does, and the minutes do not, and the shorthand-writer does not.

*Mr. Myers:* I say with the greatest respect, supposing there is a difference of opinion——

*The Chairman:* I have already ruled that you cannot discuss this matter. I cannot allow it, and I ruled so.

*Mr. Myers:* I am doing so to try and throw oil on the troubled waters.

*The Chairman:* I cannot accept it, and I have a right to object to Sir Joseph Ward's motion also. I cannot have anything inserted in the minutes which is not a correct record of what I said.

*Mr. Myers:* I accept your ruling; but supposing you say there is a difference of opinion, that you did not mean——

*The Chairman:* Mr. Myers, I have already ruled that you are not to raise that question here at this juncture.

*Mr. Craigie:* But, Mr. Chairman, I think the minutes want something added on to them. You said to Sir Joseph Ward, "Will you please answer the question put to you"——

*The Chairman:* Mr. Craigie, I must rule you out of order. The clerk was not instructed, and it is not usual, to put evidence in the minutes, but only what the Committee instructed should go down, and, therefore the clerk put down what he was instructed to do. I do not think any good will come from any further discussion on it.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* Then, how does the clerk put in the words used by me in the minutes?

*The Chairman:* I cannot allow that either. I can only allow to go in the minutes the words the Committee instructed the clerk to put down.

*Mr. Craigie:* I cannot vote for or against minutes if I think they are not right.

*The Chairman:* That is quite fair.

*Mr. Craigie:* Will the clerk read the minutes again where they refer to that portion?

(Minutes read.)

*Mr. Craigie:* What I object to is that your remark to Sir Joseph Ward is not in the minutes.

*The Chairman:* Mr. Craigie, you must recognize that this is only a record of what was instructed to be put down.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* The minutes are supposed to be put down without instructions.

*The Chairman:* It is quite a correct record.

*Right Hon. Sir J. G. Ward:* No, it is not.

*The Chairman:* The clerk took down the words instructed by the Committee.

*Mr. Craigie:* You asked Sir Joseph Ward to answer the question put to him or refuse to do so. I cannot remember your using the word "straight" at all.

*Mr. Pearce:* It seems to me it is competent for the Committee to add something to the minutes without discussing them, if the Committee is willing to add that portion.

*Hon. Mr. Allen:* I do not think there is any harm in putting in the words "or refuse to answer."

*The Chairman:* There is no objection to those words being put in.

*Mr. Pearce:* I move that those words be added to the minutes.