sufficient means of communication between the car-conductors and the motorman, and also between the passengers and the motorman." Is that so?—I have already said that it is not so.

84. Are all your trailer cars provided with means for the passengers communicating with the

motorman?—No, they are not.

- 85. Does not the Order in Council require that they should be, according to 33 (d)?—That
- 86. In your evidence in chief you said something about the requirements of the Board in the matter of motormen, and you seem to have a fear that there would be a shortage of motormen: did I properly understand you?-I think there would. We may want to train half a dozen motormen. If we have to wait for the Board of Examiners, who have to sit in different places, we should be inconvenienced.
- 87. Do you not think that would be an absurdity? Would there not be plenty of motormen awaiting engagement?-That has not been our experience. We have a matter of difficulty rather with the motormen, because we have to take them from the conductors' ranks.
- 88. If provision were made that at least 20 per cent, of the conductors throughout the Dominion were to be trained as motormen throughout the year, would not that be sufficient?—That would not be enough for us.

89. Suppose we made it 50?—Yes, if they were able to drive a car.

- 90. You think it would be necessary to train 50 per cent. of the conductors per annum?—If we were going to wait, yes. Any number of men would be able to pass an examination that we should not care to put on a car.
- 91. You said you were rather afraid there would not be sufficient motormen in the country ?--

would not take certificated motormen necessarily from Auckland or Wellington.

- 92. Do you think it would be necessary to train 50 per cent. of the conductors per annum to provide motormen for New Zealand?—That would give us a bigger margin than twenty.
- 93. I think you stated in reply to Mr. Rosser that you grant certificates to motormen who pass your examinations?-Yes.

94. Have you a specimen certificate with you?—No.

- 95. Can you give the Committee an idea of what it sets out ?-It sets out the number of hours in the various kinds of training he has done on the road, and it is signed by the Traffic Superintendent and also by the Engineer.
 - 96. Does it make any mention of the man having passed any examination?-I think the

Engineer's certificate infers that, if it is not stated.

- 97. The certificate is handed to the man immediately if he gets the training?—He gets it after It is left on a file in the office, and when the man leaves he gets it. he leaves.
- 98. I suppose he does get it on leaving?—I have never heard of a case where it has been refused.
- 99. I suppose you are opposed to the Appeal Board provided for in the Bill?-I am, very much
- 100. Is it to the Appeal Board at all or to the composition of the Board !-- It is to the Appeal Board. My objection is not because my decision may be reviewed by somebody else. That is not in my mind at all. But it is going to interfere with the efficiency of the service, and, that being so, the public are going to suffer.

101. Supposing the Legislature decided that there is to be a Board, you do not object to the composition of it?--Yes: it practically means that, as in the case of the Arbitration Court, the

award or decision will be given by the Chairman.

102. Supposing the Minister appealed to you for your advice in drawing up this clause for the Appeal Board, what would you advise as to its composition?—Assuming that we were to have an Appeal Board?

103. Yes?-That would require consideration. The Railway service has an Appeal Board with a Magistrate as Chairman, and even that does not give satisfaction to the employees.

104. I should like to have your opinion as to what would be a fair and impartial Appeal Board !- I cannot say, because a Resident Magistrate is the Chairman of the Railway Appeal Board, and his decisions are not always acceptable. I do not know whom you could have, unless you had a Judge of the Supreme Court.

105. Do you think it would be impossible to get such a Board?-I think it would be very

difficult to get a Board whose decisions would be acceptable to both sides.

- 106. Does that not apply to every tribunal?-In a Court a man knows that his case will be fought out by both sides, which might not always be the case on the Appeal Board.
- 107. Why would it not be fought out fairly?—Yet it seems like getting a steam-hammer to crack a nut with, to get a Supreme Court Judge as Chairman of the Board.
 - 108. Some of the appeals are very important ones?—Yes, and some may be very trivial ones.
- 109. I would like to get your advice, assuming there is to be an Appeal Board !- I cannot advise you.
- 110. With regard to the car report-book, you say that you originally tried it and found it a failure?—Yes, we did.
 111. Can you give reasons?—First of all, the book got absolutely dirty. The men were not
- to blame for that, for they come in in a dirty and dusty condition, and cannot help it. The book got perfectly repulsive, and you had to handle it gingerly. Then the reports were not independent. Another objection is that under our sheet system the sheet goes from one officer to another and back to the Engineer, while with the book that could not be done.

 112. How many books had you?—One book.

113. The idea is to have a book for ever car: would that not overcome the difficulty?-To a certain extent it would, but these sheets answer the purpose just as well.