

70. Well, Mr. Walklate is saying what is quite correct when he told the Committee that you told him in conversation that the Department would not approve of the air brake?—Yes.

71. And that you did not think it worth while continuing the experiments?—Yes.

72. So that Mr. Walklate was quite correct in giving not the words but the effect of his conversation with you?—Yes.

73. And, although that was not in writing, do you not think that justified him in assuming that the Department would not approve of the air brake?—Yes, I suppose so.

74. Do you know anything about the Freund brake?—Only by description.

75. So that you do not know whether you personally would approve of that or not until it has been tested?—Oh, no!

76. So that it would not be reasonable to ask this company to bring out 100 sets of Freund brakes and fix them at very great cost until they had experimented?—No, the Government would not do such a thing.

77. The magnetic brake, we have been told by Mr. Walklate and other witnesses and motormen, is in their opinion not so good as the air brake. That you dispute?—Certainly.

78. Now, would not the installation of the magnetic brake require not only the renewal of the controllers, but would it not also require new trucks?—No, I do not think so.

79. Well, if Mr. Walklate says that it would, are you in a position to dispute that?—I would not dispute it offhand.

80. And you have not gone into the question so carefully as to be able to say definitely?—No.

81. You have spoken of the deficiencies in the Auckland original Order: have not those deficiencies been made up in the extending Orders?—Yes.

82. So that Auckland is practically in the same position as the other centres?—As regards the extensions, but they are not having quite the practical effect.

83. But the tendency is in that direction, because they can only run cars upon the extensions which are in accordance with all the later Orders in Council, and they cannot afford to buy cars especially for extensions?—That question cropped up between Mr. Walklate and myself when I was last in Auckland. He asked us to pass two cars which we had refused, because it was so foolish their being prohibited to run on the extensions and they could run in the city.

84. Did you pass them?—I think we are negotiating about them. Mr. Walklate agreed to make one or two minor alterations.

85. You have seen all the cars that Mr. Walklate put the brakes on?—Yes.

86. And some have been approved quite recently?—Yes.

87. Considering the difficulties in regard to the magnetic brakes, and considering the trouble in regard to the air brake, and considering, after you told them what you did in Auckland, that they ordered Freund brakes, do you say they have been contumaciously delaying?—I would not like to say that.

88. Have they not shown a disposition to meet your requirements?—Yes.

89. And are they not still showing a disposition to meet your requirements?—We think so, although we have no evidence of it.

90. The question of brakes is rather a difficult one?—I do not think so.

91. There appears to be a great deal of difference of opinion?—There has been no difficulty in Wellington, Christchurch, or Dunedin.

92. At all events, your view is that you personally would not approve the air brake in lieu of the hand-brake plus the present track brake and the electric brake, and you practically told Mr. Walklate so?—That is so.

93. *Mr. O'Shea.*] Objection has been taken to the magnetic brake for the reason that it is merely a stop brake, and does not hold the car at a standstill; but the hand-brake holds the car, does it not?—Yes.

94. And the motormen can readily apply it?—Yes.

95. In reference to the Brooklyn accident and the Cuba Street trouble, is it not a fact that in both of those cases the motormen alleged failure of the brakes?—Yes.

96. What was the opinion you formed from the inquiries you made?—My opinion was that it was a failure on the part of the motorman, particularly in the case of the Brooklyn accident.

97. There has been a question raised as to the repair-book and reports on cars. The practice used to be for the reports to be written and left in a book which the motorman could look over; but the practice now is that a single sheet should be made out every day. Which do you think is the best system, the system of having a single sheet, or a book which may be looked over by the motormen?—If I were the manager I think I would adopt the single sheets.

98. *Mr. Rosser.*] Was it the company or the Department that suggested the Freund track brake?—The company.

99. Would you be surprised to know that Mr. Walklate has not received, or had not up till a fortnight ago received, any word that the seven sets of brakes had been shipped?—When I saw Mr. Walklate in Auckland a few weeks ago he had not received any information.

100. About when was this suggestion made of getting the Freund track brake? Would that be about July that the tests were made?—I could not say now, but I think the question first cropped up when Mr. Tegetmeier, the attorney for the company, and Mr. Walklate had an interview with Mr. Blow and myself on the matter.

101. That would be in January or February last?—Twelve months ago, yes. I think the Freund brake cropped up then in discussion. It was Mr. Tegetmeier's desire to test the air brake first.

102. And the tests took place in June?—Yes.

103. Do you think that is a reasonable time before the brakes are shipped to comply with recommendation of the Royal Commission?—I understood that the Freund brake was in an