

FURTHER PAPERS

RELATIVE TO

THE LOSS OF HER MAJESTY'S SHIP

“ORPHEUS.”

(In continuation of D. No. 1A, Sessional Papers, 1863.)

PRESENTED TO BOTH HOUSES OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY BY COMMAND OF
HIS EXCELLENCY.

AUCKLAND:

1863.

FURTHER PAPERS

RELATIVE TO

THE LOSS OF H.M.S. "ORPHEUS."

No. 1.

CAPTAIN WING TO THE HONORABLE THE COLONIAL SECRETARY.

Manukau, 20th October, 1863.

SIR,—

I am very sorry that I should feel compelled to trouble you with this communication,—but I trust for excuse to the fact that a Committee of the Provincial Council of this Province have brought up a report which I assert to be entirely erroneous in its essentials, as I can prove, and which has the effect of being exceedingly injurious to my interest and character as a subordinate officer in the public service.

Now, as I hold my appointment of Pilot of the Manukau from the General Government, I would respectfully crave leave to appeal to you for justice, if indeed the General Government are not already aware from previous investigations some months ago, that I am not guilty of the neglect of duty with which I am charged.

My earnest request is that a full and searching investigation of my conduct be instituted; but whether this should be at the instance and direction of the General Government, or by petition from me to the General Assembly, under the Regulations regarding Private Grievances, I am not aware, but will gladly abide by your wishes or instructions.

In order to show in some degree the nature of the evidence relied upon by the Committee of the Provincial Council, I may be permitted to say that some only of my letters to the late Superintendent were before the Committee, and my conversations with that functionary, having important relation to the correspondence, were not taken into account. Also, that the sole evidence of the signahman, who understands the English language but very imperfectly, as to my having abundant means at my command to launch the life-boat, &c., is considered sufficient to condemn me, while I am not permitted to bring forward the counter evidence of men of known capacity for judging in such matters, such as Captains and Commanders in the Royal Navy, and Masters and others in the Mercantile Marine Service, but was told to make reply only to the questions put to me.

In the hope that you will give the above your consideration, and at your leisure kindly point out to me what is best to be done under the circumstances,

I have, &c.,

THOMAS WING,

Pilot for the Manukau.

The Honorable the Colonial Secretary,
Auckland.

No. 2.

THE UNDER-SECRETARY TO CAPTAIN WING.

Colonial Secretary's Office,

Auckland, 4th December, 1863.

SIR,—

I am directed by Mr. Fox to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of the 20th October last, relative to a Report of a Committee of the Provincial Council of Auckland, impugning your conduct as Pilot at Manukau, and, in reply, to state that your explanations should be addressed to his Honor the Superintendent of the Province of Auckland, under whose control you are, and by whom the matter to which you refer was submitted to the Provincial Council.

I have, &c.,

Capt. Wing,
Pilot, Manukau.

W. GISBORNE,
Under-Secretary.

FURTHER PAPERS RELATIVE TO

No. 3.

THE HONORABLE THE COLONIAL SECRETARY TO THE SUPERINTENDENT OF AUCKLAND.

Colonial Secretary's Office,
Auckland, 30th October, 1863.

SIR,—

With reference to former correspondence relating to the conduct of the Pilot of the Manukau, I have the honor to transmit to you the enclosed copy of a letter from Captain Wing, the Pilot, and to request your Honor to be good enough to forward the Report and Evidence of the Provincial Council to this office.

I have, &c.,

WILLIAM FOX.

His Honor the Superintendent,
Auckland.

No. 4.

THE SUPERINTENDENT OF AUCKLAND TO THE HONORABLE THE COLONIAL SECRETARY.

Superintendent's Office,
Auckland, 27th Nov., 1863.

SIR,—

In compliance with the request contained in your letter, No. 428, of date 30th October ultimo, I have the honor to forward enclosed copy of the report and evidence presented to the Provincial Council by the Committee appointed to investigate into the conduct of the Pilot of Manukau.

I have, &c.,

ROBERT GRAHAM,
Superintendent.

The Hon. the Colonial Secretary,
Auckland.

Enclosure in No. 4.

EXTRACTS FROM THE JOURNALS OF THE AUCKLAND PROVINCIAL COUNCIL.

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 1ST, 1863

Manukau Harbour Committee. — On motion of Dr. Pollen, ordered, That the Documents relative to the Manukau Harbour, laid on the table by the Provincial Secretary, be referred to a Select Committee, to consist of Mr. Daldy, Mr. Harrop, Mr. J. O'Neill, Mr. Rattray, Mr. Ridings, Mr. Rowe, and the Mover, and that it be an Instruction to the Committee to consider the documents transmitted to the Council in its last Session, with the Message No. 18 of his Honor the Superintendent, as well as the evidence taken by the Select Committee appointed on the 11th March last, and to enquire and report generally as to the efficiency of the Pilot Department up to the time of the wreck of H.M.S. "Orpheus," and specially in relation to the conduct of the Officers of the Department on that occasion.

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 15TH, 1863.

Manukau Harbour Committee Report.—Mr. Daldy brought up a Report from the Manukau Harbour Committee, and the same was received, read, and ordered to be printed, together with the proceedings of the Committee, and minutes of evidence taken in the present and preceding Session.

REPORT OF THE MANUKAU HARBOUR COMMITTEE.

The Select Committee appointed by the Provincial Council on the 1st October instant, to whom was referred "The correspondence with the Colonial Secretary, relative to the Despatch of his Grace the Duke of Newcastle, concerning the loss of H.M.S. 'Orpheus,'" with instruction to consider the documents,—namely, "All correspondence that has passed with the Harbour Master and

Pilot of Manukau, relative to the wreck of H.M.S. 'Orpheus,' transmitted to the Council in its last Session, with the Message No. 18 of his Honor the Superintendent," present to the Council the minutes of evidence taken in prosecution of the enquiry committed to them, and report that they have agreed to the following resolutions :—

1. In the opinion of this Committee, the late Provincial Government, during the period from the year 1858 to the close of the year 1862 inclusively, has shown an earnest desire to improve the Harbour of Manukau, and by providing amply for the wants of the Pilot Establishment, to secure the safety and convenience of vessels at that Port.

2. That in reference to the allegations made by the Pilot, Mr. Wing, which are the subject of the Despatch of his Grace the Duke of Newcastle, no blame can be attached to the late Provincial Government. Reviewing the whole of the evidence taken on the subject of the wreck of H.M.S. "Orpheus," this Committee find nothing to justify Mr. Wing for having made such an allegation as the following :—"I feel it my duty to say that had the late Provincial Government supplied the necessary requirements of the Pilot Station, many valuable lives would in all probability have been saved on that occasion."

3. The "necessary requirements" stated to have been unsupplied, are specified in the evidence of Mr. Wing, as being—1st, Marryatt's Code of Signals, and 2nd, Launching Ways for the Life Boat—and in reference thereto it is resolved that the Committee find that the use of flags for the purpose of making signals at the Manukau Pilot Station was discontinued in the year 1861, at the instance of the Pilot and Harbour Master, Mr. Wing, and a Code of Signals, to be made by means of squares, a ball, and telegraph arms substituted ; that the evidence of the signal man, Hugh Evans, shows that in a period of three years Marryatt's Code, which was kept at the station, had not once been used ; and that, when Mr. Wing, in his letter of date 22nd of January, 1862, reported to the Superintendent that the flags of Marryatt's Code which were at the station had become "rotten," he made no requisition for a new Code, but suggested that,—“If the same is to be replaced with new ones, the New Commercial Code should be adopted ;” and the Committee find that in the Estimate of Expenditure for the Pilot Service of Manukau for the year 1862, which was forwarded to the Superintendent by Mr. Wing on the 22nd January, 1862, no item for the cost of the new Code appears. 2nd, That the state of inefficiency in which the Life Boat was found—without sails or oars, and bottom upwards, in a cave—on the occasion of the wreck of H.M.S. "Orpheus," is, in the opinion of this Committee, proof of highly culpable negligence on the part of the Pilot and Harbour Master, Mr. Wing ; the evidence of the signal man, Hugh Evans, showing that it was in the power of Mr. Wing, with the means at his disposal, always to have kept the Life Boat ready for immediate service ; and the evidence of the late Provincial Treasurer showing that the Government had no reason to believe that the boat was not so kept.

4. That the person who was on duty at the signal station at the time of the wreck of H.M.S. "Orpheus," was not the Signal-man duly appointed by the late Provincial Government ; that the Committee find that the Signal-man, Hugh Evans, received leave of absence from the station for six weeks, about the close of the year 1861, and that a young man, the son of the Pilot, Mr. Wing, was permitted, at the request of Mr. Evans, and with Mr. Wing's consent, to act as substitute for Evans during the term of his leave ; that Evans did not return to the station when his leave expired ; that he informed the Pilot, Mr. Wing, by letter from Otago that it was not his intention to return ; that Mr. Wing did not report this fact to the Provincial Government, but allowed his son to continue to draw pay as acting Signal-man, and that it appears from the evidence of the Provincial Treasurer, that neither the Superintendent of the Province, nor himself (the Treasurer) was aware at the time, at the close of the year 1862, when they ceased respectively to hold office, that the Signal-man, Hugh Evans, was not on duty at the Pilot Station.

WILLIAM C. DALDY,

Chairman.

Provincial Council Chamber,
October 15th, 1863.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE COMMITTEE.

TUESDAY, 6TH OCTOBER, 1863.

Members present :

Mr. Daldy,
Mr. J. O'Neill,

Dr. Pollen,
Mr. Ridings.

Mr. Daldy was called to the Chair.

Proceedings and Minutes of Evidence of the Committee of last session read ; also the correspondence transmitted with Message No. 18.

Captain Wing, the Harbour Master and Pilot of Manukau, examined.

Ordered, That Hugh Evans, the Signalman at Manukau, be summoned to attend on Thursday next.

Adjourned to Thursday, at 12 o'clock.

FURTHER PAPERS RELATIVE TO

THURSDAY, 8TH OCTOBER, 1863.

Members present :

Mr. J. O'Neill,

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Dr. Pollen.

Hugh Evans not being in attendance, Committee adjourned to to-morrow (Friday), at 10 o'clock.

FRIDAY, 9TH OCTOBER, 1863.

*Members present :*Mr. Harrop,
Mr. J. O'Neill,

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Dr. Pollen,
Mr. Ridings,

Hugh Evans examined.

Ordered, That Captain Wing be summoned for re-examination.

MONDAY, 12TH OCTOBER, 1863.

*Members present :*Mr. Harrop,
Mr. J. O'Neill,
Dr. Pollen,

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Mr. Rattray,
Mr. Ridings,

Captain Wing (his evidence of the 6th instant having been read over to him) examined.
Adjourned to Wednesday, 14th instant, at 10 o'clock.

WEDNESDAY, 14TH OCTOBER, 1863.

*Members present :*Mr. Harrop,
Mr. J. O'Neill

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Mr. Ridings,

Dr. Pollen, late Provincial Treasurer, examined.

Ordered, That Mr. Williamson, late Superintendent, be invited to attend.

Adjourned till 10 o'clock to-morrow.

THURSDAY, 15TH OCTOBER, 1863.

*Members present :*Mr. Harrop,
Mr. J. O'Neill,
Dr. Pollen,

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Mr. Ridings,
Mr. Rowe,

Dr. Pollen stated to the Committee that he had informed Mr. Williamson, the late Superintendent, that if he wished to make any statement to the Committee, they would be prepared to hear it to-day, and that Mr. Williamson replied, as follows :—

Upper Queen-street, Auckland,
Oct., 15th, 1863.

SIR,—

It was not until noon this day that I received your note, inviting me, on behalf of the Chairman, to attend a meeting of the "Manukau Harbour Committee," to be held at 10 a.m.

May I request that you will have the goodness to convey to the Committee my thanks for their courtesy in affording me an opportunity to make any statement I desired relative to the matter under their consideration ; and at the same time to inform them that, unless there be some particular information which they wish me to supply, I would prefer that the Pilot's statement should be investigated by the Committee upon evidence which can be supplied by other officers of the Government to which I had the honor to belong, rather than by myself.

Yours, &c.,

J. M. Haslett, Esq., Clerk of the Committee.

J. WILLIAMSON.

Draft Report read, and the several paragraphs having been put *seriatim*, were severally agreed to
Committee adjourned till 12 o'clock this day.

ADJOURNED MEETING.

Members present :Mr. Harrop,
Dr. Pollen,Mr. Ridings,
Mr. Rowe.

Mr. Daldy (Chairman).

Copy of Report read and adopted.

The Chairman was directed to bring up the Report this day.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN BEFORE THE MANUKAU HARBOUR
COMMITTEE.

TUESDAY, OCTOBER 6TH, 1863.

Present : Captain Daldy, in the Chair ; Mr. J. O'Neill, Dr. Pollen, and Mr. Ridings.

CAPTAIN WING examined.

By Dr. Pollen.] I am Pilot and Harbour-Master of Manukau. I was appointed by Mr. Williamson (Superintendent). I do not recollect in what year. I was at first paid £150 a year, and was also allowed the Pilot fees. This was altered about two years since. The Pilot fees were taken from me, and £50 added to my salary. I complained to Mr. Williamson that my salary was swallowed up by expenses incurred at Onehunga during my attendance there upon vessels. I was on that account dissatisfied. I do not recollect the date of Evans' leaving the Station. He left upon leave granted by official letter. I know no reason for his leaving. When he left, his place was filled by my son. I did not apply for the appointment for my son ; but Evans applied for leave to put a substitute in his place during his absence. I approved of the appointment. I should think the Superintendent was aware of the appointment. I sent it to Mr. Williamson, but did not write officially. Evans asked for six weeks' leave of absence. When the time was expired Evans did not return. I did not report this to the Superintendent officially, but I mentioned it in conversation. I did not report Evans absent, because he had written to me to keep the place open for him, and I therefore expected him to return.

Q. Did you make any report to the Superintendent between the time of the expiration of Evans's leave and the wreck of the "Orpheus" that he had not returned to his duty ?

A. I do not recollect that I did. The requirements applied for by me and not supplied by the Provincial Government were Marryatt's Signals and the means necessary for launching the life-boat. I had not been in the habit of using flags for signals, except Captain Drury's pennants, as in his directions. I have been in the habit of using an old code of flag signals. I recommended a change of signals—the disuse of flags. I consider flag signals to be useless to ships in the offing ; they are always too much "end on." The plan of a new code of signals was suggested by me to the Provincial Government, and the code was afterwards prepared by me from materials supplied by the Provincial Government. The Government supplied all that was required. I considered the new code to be sufficient at that time. That code of signals was in good working order at the time of the wreck of the "Orpheus." Flags formed no part of that code ; nevertheless at the time the new code was adopted I recommended that Marryatt's Signals should be kept for the purpose of signalling vessels passing the Pilot Station, although they would be of no use in signalling vessels outside. I made this recommendation verbally to Mr. Williamson. Dr. Pollen was present. I never made that recommendation in writing ; but when the flags were worn out, I reported that officially in writing to Mr. Williamson, mentioning at the same time that, if I were to be supplied with new signals, I would recommend that the new Commercial Code should be supplied. To this report I received no reply. I have a copy of that report.

Q. Could the Signal-man have informed you when in the "Wonga Wonga" by means of the new code that there was a vessel on the Bar ?

A. He could not. There is no danger signal in that code. There is a signal to a vessel passing to come to anchor. He could have made that signal, but he did not. I know that signal. If he had made it, I could not have compelled the Master to bring his ship to an anchor, nor should I have understood it. There was no appearance of any danger to us on board the "Wonga Wonga." The other requirement not supplied was the ways for launching the life-boat. I made official application for a carpenter and material to construct it. I received no reply. I have four men at the Station besides the Signal-man. The men are constantly at work when at the Station in improving the place. There is timber at the Station, but some way off. I could not make the ways without assistance. Two or three vessels a month generally came into the Port of Manukau. Piloting those

FURTHER PAPERS RELATIVE TO

vessels and improving the place was my business. I had not the material necessary for the ways. I had time, if I had had the materials and a carpenter. I made no written application for a crew for the life-boat. There were a number of buoys provided for marking the inner channel of the Harbour. They were left at Onehunga for some time. They remained there only a few days after I received instructions to lay them down.

Q. Were you not told that you would not be allowed either pay or supplies until they were put down?

A. I was not.

By the Chairman.] Supposing the ways had been in good order, could the crew have launched the life-boat?

A. If they had been properly fitted they could.

By Mr. J. O'Neill.] Was it usual for you to communicate with the Government in writing?

A. Yes; still I often spoke of things verbally.

By Dr. Pollen.] Were not the requirements for the Station applied for every year by the Superintendent?

A. Yes, and every year I furnished the requirements. I was required to send an estimate of the salaries and contingencies for the Station for the year.

W. C. DALDY,
Chairman.

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 9th, 1863.

Present: Captain Daldy, in the Chair; Mr. Harrop, Mr. J. O'Neill, Dr. Pollen, Mr. Ridings.

HUGH EVANS examined.

By Dr. Pollen.] I am a sailor. I am now acting as Assistant Pilot and Signal-man at the Manukau Station. I was appointed signal-man about five years since. I acted for three years, and then (about two years ago) I asked for leave of absence for six weeks. Capt. Wing gave me a letter to take to the Superintendent. I brought an answer back, and then I left. I did not ask Captain Wing to write that letter. I wanted to visit Otago. I had leave for six weeks, but I remained away about twelve months. When I found I could not return in time, I wrote to Captain Wing. I heard at Otago that the Pilot fees were stopped, and I therefore wrote to Captain Wing to say that I could do better at Otago, but that I would come back soon. I do not write myself; the letter was written by a friend. I returned to Auckland about twelve months since. I did not report myself to Captain Wing, nor offer to resume my place. Captain Wing was aware that I had returned. When I left, the old code of signals was in use, but not all in good order. The flag used with the balls was in good order. We also had Marryatt's Code of Signals; they were complete, but some of them in bad order. It was about a year or a little more after I left that the Orpheus was wrecked. Flag signals were found of very little use at that Station, because the prevailing wind is from the West, blowing straight into the harbour, which caused the flags to be too much "end on." Whilst I was there, I was always able to make the signals.

By Mr. Ridings.] I never used the flag signals. I have seen them used by Captain Lewis. They were never used after the ball signals were adopted.

By Mr. Harrop.] On the day the Orpheus was wrecked it was clear weather, and the signals could have been seen about twelve miles by vessels coming from the North.

By the Chairman.] I was signal-man about three years under Captain Wing. During that time I had no private signals. There were no danger signals arranged with the Pilot to intimate to him a vessel in danger.

By Dr. Pollen.] During all those three years was Marryatt's Code of Signals ever used?

A. Never.

Q. Were you at the Station when the life-boat was sent there?

A. Yes, I brought it down from Onehunga.

Q. What was done with the boat?

A. It was put into a shed, about twenty feet beyond high water mark. There would have been no difficulty in making rough launching-ways from the shed to launch the boat. There is plenty of timber close to the Station. The ways could have been made by Captain Wing with the hands he had, and the boat launched easily. Before I left, I shifted the boat into a cave, close to high water mark. I did so because the sand drifted around the shed, and caused it to rot. At the time of the wreck, the boat was in the cave, bottom up. She might have been easily launched from the cave, because it is close to the water, where it is deep, and no ways are necessary. The boat had sails and oars, but they have been used for the whaleboat.

By the Chairman.] I resumed my duties as Assistant Pilot and Signal-man about six months ago. It was about six weeks after the wreck of the "Orpheus."

WILLIAM C. DALDY,
Chairman.

MONDAY, OCTOBER 12th, 1863.

Present: Captain Daldy, in the Chair; Mr. Harrop, Mr. J. O'Neill, Dr. Pollen, Captain Rattray, Mr. Ridings.

CAPTAIN WING examined.

By the Chairman.] I wish to add a few words in explanation of my former evidence. I was appointed Pilot by Governor Browne, and Harbour Master by Mr. Williamson. My salary was

increased to £200 a year, with fees, and then altered to £250, without fees. Evans left the Station 14th September, 1861. One steamer and about six small traders came into the port monthly. Some of the traders require a Pilot, and some do not. I made no application for a crew for the life-boat, because I was informed there were no funds applicable to that purpose. I put in the following letters, and copies of letters, and papers, as corroborative of my evidence :—

11th January, 1860—"Captain Wing to Superintendent" (copy).
 1st September, 1860— Do. do. do.
 13th December, 1860— Do. do. do.
 22nd January, 1862— Do. do. do.
 30th April, 1862— Do. do. do.
 13th September, 1862— Do. do. do.
 27th November, 1862— Do. "Sir George Grey"—Enclosure—(copy).
 12th December, 1862—"Mr. Gisborne to Captain Wing" (original.)
 26th February, 1863—"Captain Wing to Superintendent" (copy.)
 23rd September, 1863—"Captain Renner to Captain Wing" (original.)

I have no recollection of having received any reply, either in writing or verbally, to my letter of the 30th April, 1862, either from the Superintendent, Dr. Pollen, or Mr. R. Lusk. I do not recollect that Mr. Robert Lusk told me that by the Superintendent's orders the requisites applied for in that letter would not be supplied until the buoys were laid down. All I recollect upon the subject, is that when the buoys were laying at Onehunga, I met Mr. Williamson there, and he asked me when I was going to lay them down. I replied, that I was only waiting for his permission to obtain the mooring chains, and that I had sent him notice of what I required for that purpose. When the buoys were ordered, the chains were not ordered. When I received authority to get the buoys, I did not also receive authority to get the chains. I received a letter enquiring what chains would be required.

By Dr. Pollen.] Gazette produced, publishing Signal Code. This is the Code of Signals recommended by me; they were in use at the time of the wreck of the Orpheus. Before the "Wonga Wonga" came down to the Heads the signal-man had ceased to make signals to the ship because he saw the Wonga Wonga coming. The last signal made was the arm projecting North. When the Wonga Wonga arrived the arm was taken down and the signal No. 6, "Take the South Channel" was made. This signal was intended for the Wonga Wonga, and should have had a ball upon the top, but the ball was out of order and could not be hoisted. The ball denotes a vessel leaving the harbour. The taking down the North arm would indicate to the vessel signalled that she was in a fairway. If the signal-man had known the "Orpheus" was ashore, he could have signalled the "Wonga Wonga" to take the North Channel. He did not signal to take that channel. He had been told by Captain Renner always to signal for the South Channel when that channel was practicable. It was about three hours from the time I left the "Wonga Wonga" before she returned. In the interval, I went up to my house, and took the position of the "Orpheus;" then I returned to the boat, and pulled towards the wreck. I did not go to the Signal-Station. When I saw the "Orpheus" was in danger, I could not signal to the "Wonga Wonga" in any way which he would have understood to direct him to return. The Captain would have seen a signal.

By Mr. O'Neill.] I had not the permission of the Government to use the oars and sails of the life-boat for the other boat.

By the Chairman.] At the time of the wreck the life-boat was bottom up in the cave; she was turned over to preserve her.

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 13TH, 1863.

Present—Mr. Daldy in the Chair; Mr. Harrop, Mr. O'Neill, Mr. Ridings.

DR. POLLEN being present, made the following statement :—

I held the office of Provincial Treasurer for five years, from the year 1857 till the end of 1862. Whilst I held that office, Captain Wing was appointed Harbour Master at the Manukau. His original salary was £150 per annum together with Pilot Fees. In 1859 his salary was raised to £200 per year, he still receiving the fees. He had also a free house at the Pilot-station, and the use of the Government Reserve of Land there situated. In the year 1861 an alteration was made, with the concurrence of the Provincial Government, in the mode of payment. Fifty pounds a year were added to his salary, and he was required to pay the Pilot fees collected by him into the Provincial Treasury. Mr. Wing was very much dissatisfied with this arrangement. An arrangement of a similar kind was made in the Auckland Harbour Department, in the previous year.

The money for the management of the several Pilot and Harbour Establishments of the Province is voted annually by the Provincial Council. The vote is made under two heads, viz., Salaries and Contingencies. Salaries include the pay of the Pilots and Harbour Masters, Signal-men and Harbour boats crews. The Contingencies include the supplies for the Station, in the shape of rope, boat repairs, &c., &c., for the Signal Station. I hand in an official statement by the Provincial Accountant, showing the amount voted for Contingencies for the Manukau Harbour for the years 1858 to 1862 inclusive, from which it appears that the actual expenditure by the Provincial Government was greatly in excess of the sums voted :—

FURTHER PAPERS RELATIVE TO

RETURN OF AMOUNTS APPROPRIATED FOR CONTINGENCIES OF THE MANUKAU
HARBOUR, BY THE APPROPRIATION ACTS, FOR THE YEARS 1858 TO 1862,
BOTH INCLUSIVE, WITH THE AMOUNTS EXPENDED EACH YEAR.

	AMOUNT VOTED.			AMOUNT EXPENDED.		
	£	s.	d.	£	s.	d.
For the year 1858	480	0	0	1,183	10	6
Do. 1859	176	0	0	134	11	8
Do. 1860			206	4	6
Do. 1861	100	0	0	540	19	7
Do. 1862	100	0	0	62	19	8
	£856	0	0	£2,128	5	11

R. B. Lusk,
Provincial Accountant.

In the early part of the year 1861, the Pilot reported that it was necessary there should be a new code of signals for the Manukau Harbour, flags which were then employed having been found, owing to the prevailing winds, and the distance at which signals were obliged to be made to ships approaching the Harbour, to be perfectly useless. A new code, the one at present in use, was devised by the Pilot himself, approved of by the officer in command of Her Majesty's Ship on this station, and established. Of this code flags form no part, the signals being made by large squares and balls, and by telegraph arms. In the year 1861, a number of buoys were procured for marking the inner channel of the harbour. It is within my personal knowledge, as a member of the Government of the Province, that these buoys lay at Onehunga for several months after the time that Mr. Wing, the Pilot, had been instructed to take measures for having them laid down. I myself remonstrated with him frequently on his neglect in this matter. Finally, in the month of April, 1862, it was found necessary to declare to Captain Wing that until this work of laying down the buoys was completed by him, he would neither be permitted to incur the expenditure which he then declared necessary at the Pilot Station, nor receive his own salary. That communication was made to him by myself personally, and was also made to him by the Clerk of Records, as a memorandum on the Record No. 848-62 will show. The Superintendent had become greatly dissatisfied at the general negligence of the Harbour Master and Pilot, and with what appeared to be the extravagance of the expenditure of the Pilot Station, the cost of that single establishment, in the matter of "Contingencies," being greater than the charge for the whole of the other Pilot Establishments in the Province under the same head. I have made these statements for the purpose of showing that in so far as expenditure of money could secure the efficiency of the Manukau Harbour Department, the Government were ready to and did actually incur the responsibility of making a much larger expenditure than the votes of the Council authorised. With respect to the particular charges made by the Harbour Master against the Government in reference to the wreck of H.M.S. "Orpheus," that is to say, having refused to supply Marryatt's Code of Signals, and having refused to make provision for the launching of the life-boat, I have only to say, as a member of the Provincial Executive of that time, that having had before us the facts that flags as the means of communicating with ships at the Manukau had been disused altogether, and knowing also that the Marryatt Code of Signals, which had been formerly supplied, had rotted in the pigeonholes in the signal-house, none having during a period of three years been used, it did not appear that there was any urgent necessity to incur the expenditure for a new code; neither did the Harbour Master himself state that such a code was absolutely required at the Manukau, as in his letter of January 22nd, 1862, he simply reported the fact that the code (Marryatt's) which he then had was rotten and not fit for use, and he suggested (I use his own words) "that if the same is to be replaced, that the new Commercial Code should be adopted." With respect to the lifeboat, I was under the impression that she was housed in the manner in which the Harbour Master was instructed to have her housed, and that means of launching her had been provided. When the boat arrived here, it is within my knowledge that she was completely found in every respect, and I heard with surprise that, at the time of the wreck of the "Orpheus," the lifeboat was found to be laid bottom upwards in a cave near the Pilot Station, and that she was provided neither with oars nor sails, those articles having been used for other purposes from time to time at the Pilot Station. I desire to say that, with respect to the occurrence on the occasion of the wreck, it appears to me, after carefully considering the evidence given by the Signal-man at the inquest on the body of John Pascoe, that, at the time the "Wonga Wonga" steamer was passing the Pilot Station, he, the Signal-man, had not comprehended the position of danger into which the "Orpheus" had got; he had already ceased to make signals to that ship, and had hauled down all the squares. When the "Wonga Wonga" approached, he made a signal to her to proceed to sea by the South Channel. With respect to the Signal-man himself, I was surprised to find that the person, Hugh Evans, who had been

appointed to that duty in 1858, was not then at the Station, and that his place was filled by a young man, the son of Captain Wing, about eighteen months before. Leave of absence was granted to the Signal-man for a period of six weeks, and at the request of Captain Wing his (Captain Wing's) son was permitted to act as substitute for a Signal-man during the term of his leave of absence. No report was made either to the Superintendent, nor was it either in his (the Superintendent's) knowledge, nor in mine as Provincial Treasurer, that the Signal-man, Hugh Evans, had not returned to his post, and was not on duty at the close of 1862, when I ceased to hold office. I may say generally, that we had become so much dissatisfied with Mr. Wing's want of energy and attention to his duties, that if the late Government had remained in office, it is most probable he would have been removed from his appointment at the close of the year 1862.

By the Chairman.] Had the Provincial Government, during the year 1863, the power of removing or appointing Pilots?

A. Technically they had not. The appointment of Pilots was made by the Governor. Practically, inasmuch as the salary of the Pilot was paid by the Provincial Government, the change might have been effected. I believe that the power of appointing and removing Pilots was, since the year 1862, vested in the chief Marine Board, appointed under an Act of the General Assembly of the last Session.

By Mr. Ridings.] Had you any reason to suppose that the Station boat, &c., were in a ruinous and dilapidated condition?

A. None at all. I may here state I was aware that Captain Wing had a number of men under him, who for three-fourths of their time were not on actual duty, and it appeared to us that the Station, under the circumstances, and with the amount of material which was constantly being supplied, ought to have been in that perfect state of efficiency in which it was always the desire of the Government to see it.

By the Chairman.] What caused so large an excess of expenditure in 1858?

A. It was caused principally by the cost of erecting a new house for the Pilot, on the hill near the Station; the cost of that house was about £600. The excess in 1861 was partly caused by the erection of a new Signal-staff and gear.

WILLIAM C. DALDY,
Chairman.

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS AND OF THE EVIDENCE TAKEN BY THE MANUKAU PILOT STATION COMMITTEE, SESSION XV., 1863.

Order of Reference.

On the motion of Dr. Pollen—*Ordered*: "That Message No. 18 of His Honor the Superintendent be referred to a Select Committee, to consist of Mr. Bateman, Mr. Daldy, Mr. King, Mr. Skeen, and the Mover, with instruction to enquire and report generally as to the efficiency of the Pilot Department of the Harbour of Manukau, and specially in relation to the conduct of that Department on the occasion of the wreck of H.M.S.S. 'Orpheus.'"

PROCEEDINGS OF COMMITTEE.

FRIDAY, MARCH 13TH, 1863.

Committee met pursuant to notice.

Present: Mr. Bateman, Mr. Daldy, Mr. King, Mr. Rattray, Mr. Skeen, Dr. Pollen (mover.)

On the motion of Mr. Daldy, Dr. Pollen took the chair.

Mr. Daldy produced correspondence relative to the Manukau Harbour Pilot Station, of which the letters numbered as follows were read:—

No. 93—	16th January, 1860,	(Captain Wing).
No. 884—	30th April, 1862,	ditto.
No. 1670—	13th Sept., 1862,	ditto.
No. 1671—	13th ditto, ditto,	ditto.
No. 480—	26th February, 1863,	ditto.

Moved by Mr. Daldy—That a letter be written to Captain Wing, requesting him to attend the Committee, with his boat's crew, on the first occasion of his visiting Onehunga, and that Captain Wing be requested to report himself at the Superintendent's Office; also a letter to Mr. Evans, late Signal-man at the Manukau Pilot Station.

Agreed to.

Committee adjourned to Tuesday, 17th instant, at 12 o'Clock.

DANIEL POLLEN,
Chairman.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN BEFORE THE MANUKAU PILOT STATION COMMITTEE.

MONDAY, MARCH 23RD, 1863.

Committee met pursuant to adjournment.

Present—Mr. Bateman, Mr. King, Mr. Rattray, Mr. Daldy (in chair.)

Minutes of former meeting read and confirmed.

Mr. EVANS in attendance, and examined.

To Chairman.] I left the Pilot Station at the Manukau when the pilotage fees were stopped. I acted as Second Pilot. No one ever told me I was not to act as such. When I left I had leave of absence for six weeks. I acted as Signal-man. I went to Otago, and was longer away than I expected. When I came back I did not report myself. I had no communication with the Harbour Master or any one connected with the Government. My pay was £7 a month, and I thought it too little to support my wife and family. I never told Captain Wing that I did not intend returning to my situation. I was never told by any one that I was not required. I never got any pay from the time of asking leave. I left my situation on the 14th of the month, but was never paid for that portion of the month.

To Mr. Bateman.] Mr. Wing's son acted in my absence. Mr. Wing wrote a note for me to convey to the Superintendent asking leave for Mr. Wing's son to act in my absence. The Superintendent gave me a sealed letter to Mr. Wing in reply. I don't know the contents of that letter. I thought the Station was quite safe in the hand of Mr. Wing's son, as he had often acted as Signal-man previously. I think he was quite competent to act as Signal-man. I never heard any complaint against him. **My only reason** for leaving was that I considered £7 a month too little to support my wife and family. I had no other reason for leaving. I was in the situation seven years. No accident occurred in my time.

To Chairman.] The new signals were not in use when I left. The old signals were in very bad order. They were all tattered. I had to patch them almost every day. There were no danger signals arranged between me and the Pilot. I could not have told him if a vessel was in danger outside when he was coming down the Harbour. We had not Marryatt's signals.

To Mr. King.] My name is Evans. I have been a sailor twelve years. I served my time in a coasting vessel off Wales. I arrived in this Colony about ten years ago. I was never accustomed to act as Signal-man until I went to the Manukau. I was at sea all the time from leaving home until I went to the Manukau. I was coxswain in the boat with Captain Lewis, and appointed Signal-man after he left. I complained to Mr. Wing that the signals were in bad order. I thought there was a necessity for having signals in the event of Mr. Wing's absence, and I told him so several times. There was no arrangement between the Harbour Master and me in case any vessel was in danger. I used to get all the pilotage fees of the vessels I piloted. Mr. Wing's son had charge of the Pilot Station when I left. My pay averaged between £10 and £11 a month when I had the pilotage, including salary. I don't remember having ever made any complaint to Captain Wing or any other person connected with the Government. After I went to Otago I got Mr. Graham to write that I would not return to the situation, for I was not contented with the low rate of wages I had been getting. I never received any answer to that letter. I never received any notification that I was not to go back, nor heard of anyone being appointed in my place. I never gave any intimation when I left that I would not return again. I thought my services were not again required.

To Chairman.] I have been on the South Head of the Manukau a hundred times. If I had to plant a Flagstaff at the Manukau Head I would put it on the South Head, because its signals would be much better seen than they are at present, in consequence of a much higher hill being at the back of the present Signal Station.

To Mr. Rattray.] The life-boat was never used in my time. No accident occurred during the time I was there. I think the Head is too far distant from the boat.

To Chairman.] I have often had great difficulty in getting to signal during high tides, often up to the middle in water.

To Mr. Bateman.] I never heard any complaints of incompetency against young Mr. Wing. I think him quite competent.

Witness stated, in reply to Captain Wing, that he had never made any arrangement with anyone about receiving the fourteen days' pay.

Mr. Evans was thanked for his attendance, and withdrew.

On motion of Mr. King—*Ordered*, That, in consequence of the absence of the Chairman, it is desirable to adjourn until Captain Wing reports himself to Mr. O'Rorke, which he was requested to do on the earliest possible occasion.

WILLIAM C. DALDY,
Chairman.